

Contrastive Analysis of Noun Phrase in English and Indonesian on Report Text “Camel” from Developing English Competencies Textbook

Mei Isabella Ambarita¹, Selly Wanti Hutahaean², Widhi Sofie Munthe³, Dewi Kartika⁴, Anita Sitanggang⁵

^{1 2 3 4 5} University of HKBP Nommensen Pematang Siantar, Indonesia

Article Info

Article history:

Received July 16, 2023

Revised July 25, 2023

Accepted July 25, 2023

Keywords:

Contrastive Analysis

Noun Phrase

Report Text

Translation

ABSTRACT

This research aims to discover the similarity and differences of Noun Phrase (NP) used in English and Indonesian sentences. This scientific writing used an instrument of report text as the reference to collect data. The report text was taken from a textbook of Developing English Competencies for senior high school. This research demonstrated that when English Noun Phrase was translated to Indonesian, there were changes in syntactic pattern, syntactic category, and meaning. Based on the research results, researchers found several similarities between Indonesian and English Noun Phrases. Similar parts, including head, determiner, and modifier, formed the Noun Phrase. However, there were also differences between them. English Noun Phrase was frequently expanded to the side of the head; meanwhile, in Indonesian, it was expanded to the back of the head. English Noun Phrase consists of a central-determiner (the, a, an); meanwhile, Indonesian Noun Phrase lacks it.

This is an open access article under the [CC BY-SA](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/) license.



Corresponding Author:

Mei Isabella Ambarita¹

University of HKBP Nommensen Pematang Siantar, Indonesia

Email: meiambarita22@gmail.com

1. INTRODUCTION

The English language is a prime example of the value of learning a language because it is the most widely spoken language in the world and is also the international language [2]; [10]; [14]. In several nations, it is used as the primary language. Many fields, including commerce, engineering, medicine, and education, heavily rely on English. Recognizing the immense significance and role of the English language, it is undeniable that a growing number of individuals from diverse backgrounds are eager to acquire fluency in it. Delving into the underlying motivations behind this desire to master English, it becomes clear that the allure of prestige compels many. They believe that possessing English proficiency elevates their social standing and grants them access to esteemed circles within society (Wardhaugh in [12]).

However, most Indonesian students who aspire to master the English language encounter a considerable challenge in their pursuit [13]. They grapple with comprehending the distinctive nuances between English and Indonesian sentence construction, particularly regarding the

utilization of Noun Phrases (NP). The construction of NP in English diverges significantly from its Indonesian counterpart. In order to dispel the prevalent misconception that English is an arduous language for Indonesian learners, researchers must elucidate the clear disparities in the usage of NP in both languages. By doing so, researchers can provide invaluable assistance to students, enabling them to acquire a more profound understanding of English as their target language.

According to Fromkin (in [6]), identifying noun phrases is straightforward as they can function uniquely as either the subject or object in a sentence. This distinct characteristic is exclusive to noun phrases, typically consisting of nouns or pronouns. Hudson (in [6]) further supports distinguishing noun phrases from nouns, as they serve different grammatical purposes. It is commonly accepted that nouns combine with adjectives to form noun phrases, while these noun phrases then combine with verbs to create clauses.

A noun phrase is an essential component of a larger linguistic structure known as a phrase. A phrase is a harmonious arrangement of two or more words carefully chosen to convey a specific meaning. Within a phrase, the words work together seamlessly, using keywords and supporting modifiers, to form a cohesive unit within a sentence. Carl (in [13]) has identified various phrases, including Noun, Verb, Adjective, Adverb, and Prepositional Phrases. Similarly, four distinct types of phrases exist in Indonesian, including Frasa Nomina, Frasa Verbal, Frasa Adjectival, and Frasa Adverbial (Krisdalaksana in 13). Each phrase type possesses its unique structure, demonstrating the intricacies and richness of both languages' linguistic patterns.

Noun phrases typically adhere to a persuasive structural pattern characterized by a singular noun head accompanied by one or more optional qualifiers, known as modifiers [3]. The essence of the noun phrase resides within the core noun, while the presence or absence of the qualifier remains a flexible and customizable choice. Several examples of noun phrase, such as beautiful dress (modifier + head), dress in the store (head + modifier), and beautiful dress in the store (modifier + head + modifier). These three examples demonstrate the formation patterns of a noun phrase, all centered around the core noun of "dress". However, each example presents a different way of delimiting this core noun. In the first example (beautiful dress), the noun is enhanced by the modifier of "beautiful." In the second example (dress in the store), the noun is delimited by the determiner of the prepositional phrase "in the store." Lastly, the third example (beautiful dress in the store) combines both the refinement of the adjective "beautiful" and the prepositional phrase "in the store" to delimit the core noun. It is important to note that while the general formation pattern of noun phrases revolves around the core noun and the delimiter, its manifestation can vary significantly depending on the writing genre [8]; [9].

The investigation of Noun Phrase utilization in literature holds immense significance as it is commonly employed in all text forms. Diverging from everyday language, writing embraces a style prioritising succinct and impactful sentences. A notable genre within writing is report text, which serves as a gateway to the exploration of facts.

This research focuses on the utilization of NP in English Report Text translated into Indonesian. Since translation involves comparing and contrasting two languages, namely the source language and the target language, it is evident that Contrastive Analysis and the study of Translation are closely intertwined. According to Brown (in [6]), the concept of contrastive analysis entails a meticulously orchestrated examination and juxtaposition of the native and target (second) language systems. Kridalaksana (in [4]) added that using contrastive analysis in language analysis is a refined approach to ascertain the commonalities and disparities between various languages and dialects. This comprehensive analysis encompasses all facets of the language, encompassing elements such as phonetic sounds, sound systems, and grammatical structures. Hence, we propose to employ Contrastive Analysis to examine the differences between NP in English and Indonesian.

2. METHOD

The chosen method for analyzing data is the contrastive method, which involves comparing specific elements in one language with the same elements in another language. This

process helps uncover the differences and similarities in grammar, sentence structure, and overall construction between languages. Contrastive analysis is a systematic comparison of linguistic features in multiple languages [7]; [11], and it is useful for identifying and understanding the differences between the source and target language [12]. [1] emphasizes the significance of contrastive analysis in aiding language learners, stating that it acknowledges students in acquiring a new language. It also helps language learners by predicting and addressing challenges in acquiring a new language.

Contrastive analysis encompasses more than just an exhaustive examination of multiple languages; it also involves comparison of specific aspects within languages. Hence, this research aims to compare the noun phrases found in a report text about Camel. This text was sourced from a renowned textbook titled “Developing English Competencies for Senior High School Grade XI of Natural and Science Programmes”. Our approach involved identifying the noun phrases in the text, translating them into Indonesian, meticulously analyzing each noun phrase in both English and Indonesian, and ultimately drawing our conclusions based on the results.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The researchers employed a report text that expounds upon the camel. This text was sourced from the textbook “Developing English Competencies for Senior High School Grade XI of Natural and Science Programmes” [5]. The discoveries and analysis of English and Indonesian noun phrases are presented in the following table.

No	Sentence		Contrastive Analysis of Noun Phrase	
	English	Indonesian	English	Indonesian
1	The camel is a large, strong desert animal.	Unta adalah hewan gurun yang besar dan kuat.	The camel (Article + Noun) Head : camel Determiner : the	(None)
			A large, strong, desert animal (Article + Adjectives + Noun + Noun) Head : animal Determiner : a Modifier : large, strong, desert	Hewan gurun yang besar dan kuat (Noun + Noun + yang + Adjectives) Head : hewan Determiner : seekor Modifier : gurun, besar, kuat
2	Camels can travel great distances across hot, dry deserts with little food or water.	Unta dapat menempuh jarak yang sangat jauh melintasi gurun yang panas dan kering dengan sedikit makanan atau air.	Great distances (Adjective + Noun) Head : distances Modifier : great	Jarak yang sangat jauh (Noun + (yang) + Adverb + Adjective) Head : jarak Modifier : sangat, jauh
			Hot, dry deserts (Adjective + Noun) Head : deserts Modifier : hot, dry	Gurun yang panas dan kering (Noun + yang + Adjective) Head : gurun Modifier : panas, kering
			Little food (Quantifier + Noun) Head : food Determiner : little	Sedikit makanan (Quantifier + Noun) Head : makanan Determiner : sedikit
3	They walk easily on soft sand and carry people and heavy	Mereka berjalan dengan mudah di atas pasir yang lembut	Soft sand (Adjective + Noun) Head : sand Modifier : soft	Pasir yang lembut (Noun + yang + Adjective) Head : pasir Modifier : lembut
			Heavy loads	Beban berat

	loads to places that have no roads.	dan membawa orang dan beban berat ke tempat-tempat yang tidak memiliki jalan.	<p>(<i>Adjective + Noun</i>) Head : loads Modifier : heavy</p> <p>Places that have no roads. (<i>Noun + Restrictive Relative Clause</i>) Head : places Modifier : that have no roads</p>	<p>(<i>Noun + Adjective</i>) Head : beban Modifier : berat</p> <p>Tempat-tempat yang tidak memiliki jalan. (<i>Noun + Restrictive Relative Clause</i>) Head : tempat-tempat Modifier : yang tidak memiliki jalan.</p>
4	Camels also serve the people of the desert in many other ways.	Unta juga melayani orang-orang di padang gurun dengan banyak cara lain.	<p>The people of the desert (<i>Noun + Prepositional Phrase</i>) Head : people Modifier : of the desert.</p> <p>Many other ways (<i>Quantifier + Adjective + Noun</i>) Head : ways Determiner : many Modifier : other</p>	<p>Orang-orang di padang gurun (<i>Noun + Frasa Depan (Prep. Phrase)</i>) Head : orang-orang Modifier : di padang gurun</p> <p>Banyak cara lain (<i>Quantifier + Noun + Adjective</i>) Head : cara Determiner : banyak Modifier : lain</p>
5	The camel carries its own built-in food supply on its back in the form of a hump.	Unta membawa persediaan makanan bawaannya sendiri di punggungnya dalam bentuk punuk.	<p>The camel (<i>Article + Noun</i>) Head : camel Determiner : the</p> <p>Its back (<i>Possessive + Noun</i>) Head : back Determiner : its</p> <p>A hump (<i>Article + Noun</i>) Head : hump Determiner : a</p>	<p>(None)</p> <p>Punggungnya (<i>Noun + Possessive</i>) Head : punggung Determiner : nya</p> <p>(None)</p>
6	The hump is a large lump of fat providing energy if food is hard to find.	Punuk adalah gumpalan besar lemak yang menyediakan energi jika makanan sulit ditemukan.	<p>The hump (<i>Article + Noun</i>) Head : hump Determiner : the</p> <p>A large lump of fat (<i>Article + Adjective + Noun + PP</i>) Head : fat Determiner : a Modifiers : large, lump of</p>	<p>(None)</p> <p>Gumpalan besar lemak (<i>Noun + Adjective + Noun</i>) Head : lemak Modifier : gumpalan, besar</p>
7	There are two chief kinds of camels; (1) the Arabian camel also called dromedary, which has one hump, and (2) the	Ada dua jenis utama unta; (1) unta Arab disebut juga dromedaris, yang memiliki satu punuk, dan (2) unta Baktria, yang memiliki dua punuk.	<p>The Arabian camel (<i>Article + Adjective + Noun</i>) Head : camel Determiner : the Modifier : Arabian</p> <p>One hump (<i>Cardinal Number + Noun</i>) Head : hump Modifier : one</p>	<p>Unta Arab (<i>Noun + Noun</i>) Head : unta Modifier : Arab</p> <p>Satu punuk (<i>Cardinal Number + Noun</i>) Head : punuk Determiner : satu</p>

Bactrian camel, which has two humps.	<i>The Bactrian camel</i> (Article + Adjective + Noun) Head : camel Determiner : the Modifier : Bactrian	<i>Unta Baktria</i> (Noun + Noun) Head : unta Modifier : Baktria
	<i>Two humps</i> (Cardinal Number + Noun) Head : humps Modifier : two	<i>Dua punuk</i> (Cardinal Number + Noun) Head : punuk Determiner : dua

Based on the results in the table above, it is common for Noun Phrase in Indonesia to be used post-expanding. (1) The English NP, *'its back'* (Possessive : pre-determiner + Noun), translated to Indonesian becomes *'punggungnya'* (Noun + Possessive : post-determiner). The head 'punggung' is located before 'nya'. Hence, the detailed information about the head appeared after the head; (2) The English NP *'soft sand'* (Adjective : pre-modifier + Noun), translated to Indonesian becomes *'pasir yang lembut'* (Noun + Adjective : post-modifier). In English, the head is 'sand', and before the head, there is adjective 'soft'. Meanwhile, In Indonesian, the head 'pasir' is followed by adjective 'lembut'. Another example : *'heavy loads'* (Adjective : pre-modifier + Noun), translated to Indonesian becomes *'beban berat'* (Noun + Adjective : post-modifier). In English, the head is 'loads', and before the head, there is adjective 'heavy'. Meanwhile, In Indonesian, the head 'beban' is followed by adjective 'berat'. Last example : *'hot dry desert'* (Adjectives : pre-modifier + Noun), translated to Indonesian becomes *'gurun yang panas dan kering'* (Noun + Adjectives : post-modifier). In English, the head 'desert' has two adjectives as pre-modifier (hot and dry). While, in Indonesian, the head is 'gurun' followed by two adjectives as post-modifiers (panas dan kering). Therefore, in Indonesian Noun Phrase, if the adjective(s) follows a noun and there is not any modifier, the word "yang" can be used [13]. From the analysis above, researchers found that there was changing in *syntactic structure*.

Furthermore, in Indonesian language, Noun Phrases were constructed without central determiners such as "the", "a", or "an". This linguistic phenomenon is exemplified through the translation of phrases like "the camel" and "the hump" into Indonesian equivalents of "unta" and "punuk". Evidently, the absence of central determiners in Indonesian Noun Phrases allows for a refined and concise expression, as the formula of "Article + Noun" in English Noun Phrases is simplified to a singular noun in Indonesian Noun Phrase.

The noun phrases "The Arabian camel" and "The Bactrian camel" consisted of **Article + Adjective** : pre-modifier + **Noun**, then translated to Indonesian becomes "Unta Arab" and "Unta Baktria" **Noun + Noun** : post-modifier. From this phenomenon, a change in syntactic category occurred (adjective becomes noun). In the translation of these Noun Phrases, one or more nouns can stand after the head in Indonesian Noun Phrase, but each noun refers only to the previous one.

In English Noun Phrase, Cardinal Number is followed by Noun (**Cardinal Number + Noun**), such as *"one hump"* or *"two humps"*. The translation into Indonesian maintains the same structure with *"satu punuk"* or *"dua punuk"*. Similarly, when using **Quantifier + Noun**, for example *"little food"* becomes *"sedikit air"*, both English and Indonesian place the head of Noun before any modifiers. This is also similar to the Noun + Restrictive Relative Clause formula, such as "places that have no roads" or the Indonesian translation *"tempat yang tidak memiliki jalan"*. Additionally, the Noun + Prepositional Phrase formula follows the same pattern in both languages, with the head of Noun on the left side and any modifiers appearing after it.

The sentence of *'Camels can travel great distances across...'* demonstrates a linguistic phenomenon when translated into Indonesian. In English, *'great distances'* uses formula of **Adjective** : pre-modifier + **Noun**. Meanwhile, in Indonesian translation, the procedure to express *'jarak yang sangat jauh'* changes to **Noun + Adverb + Adjective** : post-modifier. This highlights

the importance of a translator's ability to identify the closest equivalents when translating languages. Translating involves more than just substituting words; it encompasses understanding words, phrases, sentences, grammatical structures, and language styles. Thus, this phenomenon reveals a shift in meaning, as the word 'great' in Indonesian is best translated as 'sangat jauh' rather than 'besar' or 'hebat', resulting in the transformation from *Adjective to Adverb + Adjective* in Indonesian language.

The noun phrase of "a large lump of fat" is typically expressed in English as a combination of **Article + Adjective + Noun + Prepositional Phrase**. However, when translated to Indonesian, 'gumpalan besar lemak', the formula changes to **Noun + Adjective + Noun**. Therefore, the noun followed by an adjective and another noun, with the prepositional phrase "of fat" represented by the noun "lemak". In English, the word "of" conveys the meaning of the noun "lump". However, there is no direct translation for "of" in Indonesian in this particular noun phrase.

The last, the translation of English Noun Phrase 'a large, strong, desert animal' (Article + Adjective + Noun + Noun) is 'hewan gurun yang besar dan kuat' (Noun + Noun + Adjective). Noticeably, in English sentence, there is an article used before the head and the adjectives as pre-modifier (large, strong) are placed before the head. Meanwhile, no article is used in Indonesian sentences, and the adjectives as post-modifier (besar, kuat) are placed after the head.

Thus, by translating English Noun Phrase into Indonesia Noun Phrase, researchers found changes, including alterations in syntax structure, syntax category modifications, and meaning shifts.

4. CONCLUSION

When we convert English Noun phrases into Indonesian, three significant phenomena may occur: alterations in syntax structure, modifications in syntax category, and shifts in meaning. Based on research results, it is evident that there exist notable similarities between NP structures in English and Indonesian languages, including (1) Both languages used similar parts to organize noun phrases, with central noun serving as the "head", modifiers acting as pre- or post-modifiers in the form of adjectives or nouns, and determiners functioning as pre- or post-determiners; (2) The patterns of prepositional phrases and relative clauses as modifiers exhibited similarities in both languages; (3) Certain Noun Phrases showcased identical grammatical pattern in terms of pre-determiner in English and Indonesian.

There also exist several differences of NP structures between English and Indonesian languages. (1) In English, the placement of noun phrases was often extended to the front of the "head" whether as pre-modifier or pre-determiner. While, in Indonesian, the expansion typically occurred at the back of the "head"; (2) In Indonesian, the possessive or pronominal 'nya' followed the "head" as post-determiner, while in English, the possessive "my/your/her/his/our/their/its" served as pre-determiner or was placed before the noun; (3) Indonesian did not employ central-determiners (the, a, an) in noun phrase, while in English, the use of central determiners is essential. For instance, translating "the camel" to Indonesian would be conveyed as "unta.

REFERENCES

- [1] Al-Khresheh, Mohammad Hamad. "A review study of interlanguage theory". *International Journal of Applied Linguistics and English Literature*, 2015, 4.3: 123-131.
- [2] Aprianti, Ira Nur; Parmawati, Aseptiana. "Derivational And Inflectional Morpheme Analysis On The Song Lyrics Of Lady Gaga "A Star Is Born" Album". *Project (Professional Journal Of English Education)*, 2020, 3.3: 322-328.
- [3] Ardianto, Ardik. "English Noun Phrases of Narrative Text and News Article: A Contrastive Analysis". *Leksema: Jurnal Bahasa dan Sastra*, 2023, 8.1: 91-104.
- [4] Auni, Luthfi, Manan, Abdul. "Contrastive analysis of English and Indonesian adverbs". *Englisia: Journal of Language, Education, and Humanities*, 2022, 10.1: 88-106.
- [5] Dody, Ahmadi, Sugeng, A. Developing English competencies for senior high school. *Jakarta: Pusat Pembukuan Departemen Pendidikan Nasional*, 2009.

- [6] Fajri, Anisah Durrotul. A Contrastive Analysis of Indonesian and English Noun Phrases: How the Differences Create Problems in Translation as Seen in “Chemistry 2A for Senior High School Grade XI Semester 1”. *Lexicon*, 2012, 1.2: 122-138.
- [7] Fauziati, Endang. “Contrastive analysis, transfer analysis, error analysis, and interlanguage: Four concepts one goal”. *Ahmad Dahlan Journal of English Studies (ADJES)*, 2014, 1.2: 9-21.
- [8] Noguera-Díaz, Yolanda; Pérez-Paredes, Pascual. “Register analysis and ESP pedagogy: Noun-phrase modification in a corpus of English for military navy submariners”. *English for Specific Purposes*, 2019, 53: 118-130.
- [9] Ruan, Zhoulin. “Structural compression in academic writing: An English-Chinese comparison study of complex noun phrases in research article abstracts”. *Journal of English for Academic Purposes*, 2018, 36: 37-47.
- [10] Saragih, Dhea. “An Analysis of Noun Found in Song “Lonely” By Justin Bieber”. *Journal Corner of Education, Linguistics, and Literature*, 2023, 2.4: 295-301.
- [11] Sulaiman, Masagus. “A contrastive analysis between english and indonesian pronominals”. *English Empower: Journal of Linguistics and Literature*, 2018, 3.2: 82-91.
- [12] Tanasy, N., Aisyah S. “A Contrastive Analysis towards English and Indonesian Noun Clauses”. *ELT-Lectura*, 2022, vol. 9, no. 1, pp. 28-47.
- [13] Tandiana, Soni Tantan. “Contrastive Analysis of Using Noun Phrase in English and Indonesian Language”. *Jurnal Siliwangi: Seri Pendidikan*, 2015, 1.1.
- [14] Uktolseja, Lulu Jola, Sujaja, Hamim, Matinahoru, Mario Fridolin. “A contrastive analysis between English and Indonesian kinds of sentences”. *IJET (Indonesian Journal of English Teaching)*, 2019, 8.1: 54-61.